

University of Miami International and Comparative Law Review

Volume 9

Issue 1 *THE FIRST ANNUAL LATCRIT SUMMER
COLLOQUIUM: SPAIN, THE AMERICAS AND
LATINO/AS: International and Comparative Law
in Triangular Perspective*

Article 15

1-1-2001

STUDENT ARTICLE: Tourism in Developing Countries - Panacea or Poison?

Christine Gudaitis

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.miami.edu/umiclcr>



Part of the [Comparative and Foreign Law Commons](#), and the [International Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Christine Gudaitis, *STUDENT ARTICLE: Tourism in Developing Countries - Panacea or Poison?*, 9 U. Miami Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. 265 (2001)

Available at: <https://repository.law.miami.edu/umiclcr/vol9/iss1/15>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at University of Miami School of Law Institutional Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of Miami International and Comparative Law Review by an authorized editor of University of Miami School of Law Institutional Repository. For more information, please contact library@law.miami.edu.

Essay: Tourism in Developing Countries – Panacea or Poison?

Christine Gudaitis*

I.	Introduction: Culture, Human Rights and Tourism	265
II.	Case Studies: Mexico, Indonesia and Tanzania.....	274
III.	Alternative/Sustainable Tourism	280
IV.	Conclusion	284

I. Introduction: Culture, Human Rights and Tourism

What is culture? Culture can be defined in many ways, but all of its definitions are vague and ever changing. Culture is defined as "a matrix of infinite possibilities and choices from which we can extract arguments and strategies for the degradation and ennoblement of our species, for its enslavement or liberation, for the suppression of its productive potential or its enrichment, the stagnation of social existence or its renewal."¹ It is also defined as "the soul of life. It is what gives us

* J.D., University of Miami School of Law; B.A., Mount Holyoke College. I first became interested in tourism and culture when I moved to St. Thomas in the U.S. Virgin Islands following my college graduation. Although technically not a "developing country," there are many on the island who live in extreme poverty. Certain areas are set up to accommodate tourists, while others are plagued with criminal activity. The island is, for the most part, visually breathtaking, although many of the residents think nothing of tossing trash out of their car windows as they drive the island's narrow roads. I worked as a bartender at an upscale resort, which was located in a high crime area. The resort itself was majestically beautiful. It was also surrounded by high walls and razor wire, and was patrolled by vigilant round-the-clock security personnel. Guests were encouraged to leave the hotel only by taxi, especially at night. Although the hotel was required to hire 75 percent of its personnel from the West Indian population, I felt somewhat guilty because of the job I had. My job paid well, although not a management position, and was considered a skilled "front of the house job" involving constant interaction with hotel guests. Most of the skilled and management jobs were held by mainland Americans of non-West Indian heritage. Although there was little hostility between guests and personnel at this resort, this was not always the case at other establishments on the island. As a white mainland American, I often experienced hostility first hand, which was easy to understand objectively, but subjectively was more difficult to appreciate on a day-to-day basis. As I slowly got to know some of the local residents, living on the island gave me an appreciation of cultural differences. Although I am not West Indian, the longer I lived there, the more I began to resent the tourists who were merely visiting the island for their own enjoyment and had little to no interest in its people. On the other hand, I recognized my financial dependence on them. Unlike most of the West Indians, however, I had no real ties to the island and could leave if I chose. But this dynamic made me realize how much more difficult it would be to be forced to depend on tourists to feed one's family or take care of one's elders, often at the expense of self and culture. All errors are mine.

¹ KRIS ENDRESEN, SUSTAINABLE TOURISM AND CULTURAL HERITAGE: A REVIEW OF DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE AND ITS POTENTIAL TO PROMOTE SUSTAINABILITY § 2 at footnote 17 (1999) (quoting from Wole Soyinka, Nigerian Nobel Laureate, Remarks for *Culture Counts: A Conference on Financing, Resources, and the Economics of Culture in Sustainable Development* conference in Florence, Italy in October 1999) [hereinafter "ENDRESEN"]; see also President of the World Bank Group James D. Wolfensohn, Remarks at *Culture Counts: A Conference on Financing, Resources and the Economics of Culture in Sustainable Development available at* <http://www.worldbank.org/html/extdr/extmsp100499.htm> (October 17, 2000); Kris Endresen, author of *Sustainable Tourism and Cultural Heritage*, is from the Nordic World Heritage

roots, gives our lives meaning; it is what binds us to each other."² The World Bank defines culture as "the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions, and beliefs."³ Culture has been described not only as the "total way of life of a people," but as a "web of signification in which members of a society are suspended, with the middle ground designated by a body of learned and transmitted behavior (at once symbiotic, patterned, and holistic)."⁴

The right to maintain one's culture and beliefs is recognized as a basic human right.⁵ Article 27 of the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that "everyone has the right to freely participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits."⁶ One difficulty in maintaining culture is that it is nebulous, and a violation of one's right to participate in one's culture is neither as obvious, nor as definitive, as a violation of, for example, the right to be free from torture or the right to fresh air. Furthermore, when the people of a less developed country are starving, there is more of an impetus for international financial institutions like the World Bank to work to correct the instant problem, and consequently the country's cultural preservation may not be taken into account at all. Additionally, the promotion of Western values through globalization may lead younger people in developing countries to eschew their own cultural heritage in favor of a system that seems to promise it all.

The right to travel is described as "one of the basic human rights now; it is something which makes the quality of life better. For some people, the right to travel has become part of political freedom."⁷ Article 7 of The World Tourism

Organization (NWHO). NWHO, in Oslo, was established in co-operation between the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and Norway as a three-year pilot project. Financed by Norway, it has been operational since March 1996. NWHO's main goal is to strengthen work relating to the World Heritage Convention. It aims to contribute to World Heritage activities in the Nordic countries, and enhance UNESCO's World Heritage conservation activities and heritage resource management generally.

² See Former First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton, Remarks at Culture Counts: A Conference on Financing, Resources, and the Economics of Culture in Sustainable Development, Florence, Italy available at <http://www.usis.it/file9910/alia/991007en.htm> (October 16, 2000).

³ THE WORLD BANK, ENVIRONMENTALLY & SOCIALLY SUSTAINABLE DEV., CULTURE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: A FRAMEWORK FOR ACTION (1998), § 1 (October 17, 2000), at <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/essd/essd.nsf/9b1cfc683a76b671852567cb0076a25e/fa8a463ac24a48668525684600720ce7?OpenDocument>.

⁴ Ákos Östör, Cultural Difference, Visual Image, and the University: An Intercultural Education for the 21st Century (October 17, 2000), at <http://www.wesleyan.edu/acad-forum/Essays/aostor.htm>.

⁵ See generally INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS, 999 U.N.T.S. 171, Preamble, Arts. 18(4) and 27 (signed December 16, 1966, entered into force March 23, 1976), at <http://www.tufts.edu/departments/fletcher/multi/texts/BH498.txt>.

⁶ UNITED NATIONS UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS, (adopted by the General Assembly of the United Nations on December 10, 1948), Art. 7(d); available at <http://kentropolis.com/zephyr/undohr/undohr.htm> (October 18, 2000).

⁷ Barbara Crossette, *The World: Surprises in the Global Tourism Boom*, N.Y. TIMES, April 12, 1998, § 4, at 5, (quoting Deborah Lührman of the World Tourism Organization).

Organization's Global Code of Ethics for Tourism⁸ states that the right to discovery of the planet's resources should be equally open to all of the world's inhabitants, and that this right must be regarded as the corollary of the right to rest and leisure, guaranteed by Article 24 of the United Nations' Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Article 7(d) of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.⁹

Tourism has recently become one of the largest industries in the world, with a 12 percent share of global GDP.¹⁰ The economic impact of tourism has the potential to help less developed and economically disadvantaged countries, but it also threatens vulnerable destinations whose culture and beauty is the very impetus for travel to that particular place.¹¹ As an Asian proverb states, "Tourism is like a fire: You can cook your soup on it, but you can also burn down your house with it." This proverb illustrates a growing concern regarding the inherent dichotomy of tourism.

Various developmental agencies and non-governmental organizations recognize that tourism is both a panacea and a poison to developing countries. Both the environment and local culture are easily put at risk by the tourist trade. World Bank President James D. Wolfensohn points out "physical and expressive culture is an undervalued resource in many developing countries. It can earn income, through tourism, crafts and other cultural enterprises. [W]hether income-earning or not, support to cultural activities of the very poor can have a profound effect on their well-being, social organization, and social functioning."¹² The need for immediate foreign capital in less developed countries, however, can result in sorely mismanaged tourism, creating a race to make money in ways that damage both the environment and the culture of the country itself.

The primary difficulty in reconciling the difference between tourism as a way to preserve the culture of developing nations and tourism which results in a "cultural sell-out"¹³ is that, in order to bring tourism to impoverished economic

⁸ World Tourism Organization, Global Code of Ethics for Tourism, Art. 7, available at <http://www.world-tourism.org/> (October 18, 2000); The World Tourism Organization is an intergovernmental organization that serves as a global forum for tourism policy and issues. Its mission is to promote and develop tourism as a significant means of fostering international peace and understanding, economic development and international trade. Members include 138 countries as well as over 350 affiliate members.

⁹ UNITED NATIONS INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS, Adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 1966, entry into force 3 January 1976, in accordance with Art. 27 available at http://www.unhcr.ch/html/menu3/b/a_cescr.htm (October 18, 2000).

¹⁰ See ENDRESEN, *supra* note 1, § 1 at 1; The World Travel and Tourism Council estimates that tourism generated 192 million jobs and 3.6 billion dollars U.S. in GDP in 1999. WTTC forecasts growth at an annual rate of 3 percent between 1999 and 2010 for the world as a whole. For the Caribbean, most of which is not highly developed, tourism represents 25 percent of the GDP.

¹¹ *Id.*

¹² See *id.* §1 at footnote 6 (quoting World Bank President James D. Wolfensohn, *Remarks for Culture Counts: A Conference on Financing, Resources, and the Economics of Culture in Sustainable Development*).

¹³ See Ramesh Jaura, *Africa: Importance of Cultural Heritage for Tourism Stressed* available at http://oneworld.org/ips2/mar98/21_55_096.html (October 16, 2000).

sectors, one introduces into these developing nations the values and ideas of tourists, not just their currency.¹⁴ Tourism can have an array of additional negative impacts such as:¹⁵

- the commodification and cheapening of culture and traditions;
- the alienation and loss of cultural identity;
- the undermining of local traditions and ways of life;
- the displacements of traditional residents;
- an increased division between those who do and do not benefit from tourism;
- conflict over (or loss of) land rights and access to resources;
- damage to cultural and environmental attractions;
- the loss of authenticity and historical accuracy in interpretation; and
- a selectivity in which heritage attractions are developed.

Ideally, tourism is an enriching experience. One travels both to enhance one's own understanding of the rest of the world, and where the people in the country visited also benefit, leading to a financially and culturally positive experience for both tourist and host country. Tourist locales are becoming increasingly alike, however, in order to maximize the financial potential of the site without taking a potentially negative financial risk, as demonstrated by the multiplicity of ubiquitous McDonald's and Hard Rock Cafes, or the fact that most people in the travel industry speak at least a passing version of English.

Tourism has thus become "the chance to go and see what has been made trite."¹⁶ This phenomenon has led some to compare tourism with theater – the illusionary perception of the tourist experience objectifying the local population. Local people are seen as actors, living merely to provide the paying customer with local color and ambiance. The impact of tourists' presence may transform the lives of the indigenous people, both with respect to the intangible diminution of local culture, and in more concrete ways, such as locals becoming tour guides rather than fishermen, or young girls and children prostituting to satisfy the tourist sex trade.¹⁷

These effects are particularly strong in developing countries, which are often not financially salient enough to make decisions about tourism that will be best for the country in the long term. Often, funds are needed for the alleviation of poverty, a problem that is understandably sometimes more pressing to government leaders than the possible future erosion of culture. Government officials sometimes

¹⁴ For example, see Editorial, *Foreigners' Complaints*, THE KOREA HERALD, October 23, 1999 available at http://www.koreaherald.co.kr/cgi-bin/searched_word.asp?qstr=complaints&path=/news/1999/10/_03/19991023_0319.htm (October 16, 2000). Ironically, this article is an exhortation to Koreans for a wholesale improvement in Korea's tourism infrastructure, in order to "make Korea and its capital Seoul a more comfortable place for foreigners," which should be a "mandate for us in this age of globalization." The article focused on foreign complaints resulting from the difficulties in understanding Korean road signs and train schedules.

¹⁵ ENDRESEN, *supra* note 1, §2.4 at 7.

¹⁶ See DENNIS R. JUDD AND SUSAN S. FIANSTEIN, *THE TOURIST CITY* (Yale University Press 1999) [hereinafter "JUDD & FIANSTEIN"].

¹⁷ *Id.*

make decisions to benefit themselves or the cultural elite, rather than the people for whom we believe they are obligated to serve.

One of the major sources of funds for the promotion of tourism in less developed countries is the World Bank.¹⁸ The World Bank has projects in developing countries throughout the world that purport to aid countries through, among other sectors, the growth of tourism. The World Bank's purpose is to promote economic growth and create jobs, ideally providing the developing country with the resources to implement social programs and improve income distribution for the entire population.¹⁹ The World Bank's intention is to incorporate less developed countries into the global economy within a framework of open competition and respect for property rights.²⁰

The resultant problem is that with the expansion of globalization and the spread of Western capitalist ideals, the cultures as well as the environments of developing countries are being compromised or lost. As Deborah McLaren, director of the *Rethinking Tourism Project*, wrote, "The globalization of tourism threatens indigenous knowledge and intellectual property rights, their cosmovision, technologies, religions, sacred sites, social structures and relationships, wildlife, ecosystems, economies and basic rights to informed understanding reducing indigenous peoples to simply another consumer product that is quickly becoming exhaustible."²¹

Although the World Bank demonstrates an awareness of the positive/negative tourism dichotomy, the awareness is from a global, free-trade-focused point of view. The World Bank interprets culture as a means to promote tourism, and thus, democratic ideals. This can be summed up in World Bank President Wolfensohn's statement that "culture can be justified for tourism, for industry, and for employment, but it must also be seen as an essential element in preserving and enhancing national pride and spirit."²² Thus, tourism causes an ever-widening schism between the different economic sectors in developing countries. Those with land to sub-divide, housing to rent, hotels to run, and labor, goods or services to sell favor the expansion of tourism, while the landless and poor are further marginalized. In such systems, rather than helping the indigent and disenfranchised, tourism merely reinforces the existing social structure.²³

¹⁸ See e.g. The World Bank Group, *World Bank Group at a Glance* available at <http://www.worldbank.org/html/extdr/about/glance/htm> (October 18, 2000); the World Bank has development projects in 24 countries in Africa, East Asia, Europe and Central Asia, as well as the Middle East and North Africa. This paper will later discuss the ramifications and viability of some of these projects.

¹⁹ World Bank, *Accord on Development Priorities for the Dominican Republic* § 1 (October 16, 2000), at <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/external/lac/lac.nsf/8ffa96b85a80b19d852567fb00738261/5f3f3af36f6d02eb8525686c006baf09?OpenDocument>.

²⁰ *Id.* § 2(b).

²¹ Martha Honey, *Protecting Indigenous Culture and Land Through Ecotourism*, CULTURAL SURVIVAL QUARTERLY, 1999, available at <http://www.ecotourism.org/textfiles/survivalrev.txt> (October 16, 2000).

²² ENDRESEN, *supra* note 1, Executive Summary at i.

²³ DAVID HARRISON, *TOURISM AND THE LESS DEVELOPED COUNTRIES* 24 (David Harrison ed. 1992).

By its very nature, tourism supports and is supported by globalization. Globalization has been described as "erasing the traditional boundaries between politics, culture, technology, finance, national security, and ecology."²⁴ Language, for example, an inseparable part of a nation's culture, is also being eradicated. In fact, half of the world's languages are expected to die out by the end of the twenty-first century.²⁵ This can be seen worldwide as indigenous people trying to make a living in the tourism sector are quick to replace their own language with English or other Western languages. Most Americans do not begin learning a second language until high school, and even then, in most cases it is a superfluous activity, unnecessary for economic survival. In many countries with less economic clout, however, English is taught almost as soon as children begin school in order to compete on an international economic level. Consequently, globalization, through tourism and the incentive to compete, is contributing to the annihilation of language, which in turn erodes a nation's culture and history.²⁶

A. The World Bank's Role

Anthropologists argue that the forces of global capitalism have created a situation in the recent past which is "decentered, fragmented, compressed, flexible, and refractive, a concept in which cultures can no longer be considered bounded, insulated, or discretely located in territorial terms, but must be understood within forces of an historical relationship spurred by world capitalist developments."²⁷

The World Bank, along with the International Monetary Fund (IMF), was founded in 1944 at the Bretton Woods Conference. These institutions were established for the purpose of economic reconstruction after the Second World War. The World Bank quickly evolved into the world's biggest developmental organization.²⁸

²⁴ Jim Chen, *Globalization and Its Losers*, 9 MINN. J. GLOBAL TRADE 157, 160 (2000) (quoting THOMAS L. FRIEDMAN, *THE LEXUS AND THE OLIVE TREE: UNDERSTANDING GLOBALIZATION* 15 (1999)).

²⁵ *Id.* at 175-76. Chen discusses the loss of cultural diversity that occurs when politically dominant languages and cultures overwhelm indigenous local languages and cultures.

²⁶ *Id.* at 174. Although this paper focuses primarily on tourism's effects on less developed countries, there is a struggle in developed countries to maintain their cultural hegemony through the maintenance of their own languages, as evident in the European Union's order that member-states must reserve at least half of all television airtime for programs of European origin.

²⁷ Rosemary J. Coombe, *The Cultural Life of Things: Anthropological Approaches to Law and Society In Conditions of Globalization*, 10 AM. U. J. INT'L L. & POL'Y 791, 79495 (1995).

²⁸ The World Bank is comprised of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development the International Development Association (IDA) (The Articles of Agreement state that its purposes involve "assisting in the reconstruction and development of territories and members," and "promoting the long range balanced growth of international trade and the maintenance of equilibrium in balance of payments, thereby assisting in raising productivity, the standard of living and conditions of labor in member's territories."); see ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE INTERNATIONAL BANK FOR RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT (IBRD), 60 Stat. 1440, T.I.A.S. No 1502, 2 U.N.T.S. 134, Art. I (entered into force Dec. 27, 1945) [amended Dec. 17, 1965, 16 U.S.T. 1942; see also THE BRETTON WOODS AGREEMENTS, ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE INTERNATIONAL BANK FOR RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT (October 17, 2000), at <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/decade047.htm>, the International Finance Corporation (IFC), and the Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency (MIGA).

In its Articles of Agreement, the International Development Association states its purpose is "to promote economic development, increase productivity, and thus raise standards of living in the less-developed areas of the world, thereby furthering the developmental objectives of the IBRD."²⁹ The Bank's Articles also state that "the Bank and its officers shall not interfere in the political affairs of any member, nor shall they be influenced in their decisions by the political character of the member or members concerned. Only *economic considerations* shall be relevant to their decisions, and these considerations shall be weighed impartially in order to achieve the purposes stated in Article I" (emphasis added).³⁰

Since the Bank's inception, its understanding of what qualifies as an "economic consideration" has steadily expanded. Originally the World Bank focused primarily on economic growth through the funding of large projects like dams, highways, and other big infrastructure projects. Now, however, the Bank is incorporating governance, economic transformation, and private sector development to its list of appropriate operations.³¹

At the outset, the Bank gave loans to specific projects, but that changed in the early 1980's with the advent of the international debt crisis. By the end of the 1980's around 25 percent of the World Bank's lending went to structural adjustment loans. The preconditions placed on these loans resulted in reductions in public sector spending and cuts in subsidies, often including those of basic food supplies. The programs have often involved focusing on the export of raw materials and other natural resources. Then throughout the eighties and nineties the private sector was given a higher priority.³² Although tourism related projects occupy a relatively small percentage of Bank funded projects, they, like the larger infrastructure projects, often have a negative effect on the people the Bank is purporting to help.

The World Bank is based on an ideology where the concept of free trade and an open economy is considered the basis for development. Consequently, many of the tourism related projects funded by the World Bank contributed not only to the globalization and homogenization of culture, but in many instances, to the eradication of culture, environment, and displacement of indigenous peoples. It should be noted that the World Bank turned away from specific tourism projects following the close of its Tourism Projects Department in 1978. Portions of the World Bank Group (WBG), however, support tourism through equity investments

²⁹ WORLD BANK, ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION, U.S.T. 2284, T.I.A.S. No. 4607, 439 U.N.T.S. 249, art. I (Jan. 26, 1960); *see also* (October 18, 2000), at <http://www.worldbank.org/ida/idaart02.htm>.

³⁰ *Id.* at Art. V, § 6; *see also* IBRD, *supra* note 28 art. IV, §10.

³¹ Daniel D. Bradlow, *Symposium: Social Justice and Development- Critical Issues Facing the Bretton Woods System: The World Bank, the IMF, and Human Rights*, 16 TRANSNAT'L. & CONTEMP. PROBS. 47, 55 (1996).

³² FORENINGEN FOR INTERNASJONALE VANN-OG SKOGSTUDIER, *FIVAS REPORT: POWER CONFLICTS* (1996) available at http://solidaritetshuset.org/fivas/pub/power_c/k15.htm (October 17, 2000). FIVAS or International Water and Forest Studies, is an independent organization based in Norway that works to obtain and disseminate information about the consequences of large dams and other hydropower projects in third world countries.

and other mechanisms. As of 1996, the WBG had invested in over 100 tourism projects, mostly hotels and resort villages, at a value of \$600 million.³³

The World Bank's International Finance Corporation (IFC) was established in 1956 to give loans to the private sector without government guarantees. It has annual investment approvals of nearly \$3 billion, making it the largest source of financing for private projects in developing countries. The IFC has a special Tourism Unit that grows steadily as worldwide demand for hotel financing expands. The IFC works closely with MIGA, an entity that sells insurance against war or national risks to tourism agencies in developing countries.³⁴ The World Bank has boasted that since 1992's United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (also known as the Earth Summit), it has become "the world's leading financier of environmental projects in the developing world."³⁵

In reality, however, most of the World Bank's tourism-related projects actually involve investments in large resorts and hotels, and thus their implementation threatens the very people and cultures they purport to help. IFC literature describes the agency's mission as "promoting sustainable tourism development." It also lists the development of ecolodges (ecologically sound guest lodges) as one of its project areas, and Costa Rica as one of the countries where these projects would be based. In a 1996 list of the 113 IFC-funded tourism projects worldwide, however, the only Costa Rican project was the Hotel Camino Real, a mass tourism complex owned by an international chain.³⁶

II. Case Studies: Mexico, Indonesia and Tanzania

"Tourist Bubble" is a phrase used to describe an area that specifically caters to tourism.³⁷ In many places, these tourist bubbles spring up in response to crime, poverty, and urban decay; they are cultivated and maintained in order to attract tourists and to keep tourists returning. These bubbles also have the effect of shielding tourists from the places where indigenous people live and work, however, and often "envelop the traveler so that he/she only moves inside secured, protected and normalized environments."³⁸ In cities, these bubbles often have little effect on the culture of the local population, but in developing countries the maintenance of a separate tourist area can assist locals by providing jobs as well as decreasing negative interaction with tourists.

A. Cancun, Mexico

Cancun, Mexico was a resort largely constructed through loans from the IFC for the sole purpose of attracting tourists. Cancun was conceived in the mid-1960s by the Mexican government as part of new federal initiatives for economic and regional development.³⁹ At that time, Mexico began to encounter economic

³³ ENDRESEN, *supra* note 1, § 4.2 at 31.

³⁴ MARTHA HONEY, ECOTOURISM AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT 81 (1999) [hereinafter "HONEY"].

³⁵ World Bank Press Release, World Bank Offers "Green Top Ten" In Advance of UN Earth Summit (June 5, 1997), available at <http://www.worldbank.org/html/extdr/extme/1377.htm>.

³⁶ HONEY, *supra* note 34 at 81.

³⁷ JUDD & FIANSTEIN, *supra* note 16 at 35.

³⁸ *Id.*

³⁹ *Id.* at 124.

difficulties because exports of agricultural and raw materials were not supplying a sufficient surplus of domestic capital. Consequently, the government looked to tourism as an alternative solution. Prior to Cancun's development, Acapulco was Mexico's only major tourist destination, and the government feared that its increasing urban chaos would repel foreign travelers.⁴⁰

The plan was approved and financed by the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). The government argued that it would increase the influx of convertible currencies, generate many new jobs out of overtaxed urban centers, and counter patterns of regional inequality. The barrier island was to consist of upscale luxury resort hotels that, according to initial projections, would cater primarily to affluent international tourists. The designers of Cancun were very strict about segregation. Low skilled workers would travel to the resort by bus, those with higher skill levels by car. Ideally, there would be little interaction between workers and tourists.⁴¹ Although this plan would emphasize class differences, it also would allow Mexicans to maintain their own culture without an excess of foreign influence.

The resort opened in 1976, and operated according to plan until the mid-1980s when the peso crisis allowed more middle-income foreigners to travel to Mexico. Mass tourism overtook Cancun after 1984, and construction in the area increased to match the new demand. Less elaborate hotels and restaurants were built, and people who were no longer interested in merely relaxing by the seaside now wanted to jet-ski, scuba dive, and deep-sea fish. This resulted in environmental devastation of the area.

Originally, Cancun was an isolated development that required a less skilled labor force. Although segregated, workers were drawn from the surrounding region. The growth of tourism in the region, however, created the need for an influx of non-local skilled laborers. The area has seen less involvement from the Mexican government and more influence from purely market forces.⁴² Unfortunately, this is resulting in an increased dichotomy between the few locals who have been successful and the remaining population, which has been impoverished by national and regional economic crises. The vast majority of Mexicans have not benefited from Cancun's development, especially because most of the jobs are no longer open to low-skilled workers. The cost of living has increased, and the available housing is poor.⁴³ These changes reflect "a clear departure from the carefully planned, government sponsored programs of the past."⁴⁴

Unfortunately, leaving the success of a resort to market forces often has this effect. The growth of the area results in more foreign investment that does not benefit the local population because most of the profits end up leaving the country. Originally, Cancun's growth positively affected the unskilled local or migrant Mexican laborer. It was built on a relatively unused site, so local displacement was minimal. Keeping the resort upscale insured that visitors would not be legion to the

⁴⁰ *Id.* at 128.

⁴¹ *Id.*

⁴² *Id.* at 138.

⁴³ *Id.*

⁴⁴ *Id.* at 139.

area, which aided in staying the despoiling of the environment. If the government had remained an active participant in Cancun's development rather than allowing it to be purely market-driven, perhaps some of these problems could have been alleviated.

B. Bali, Indonesia

Bali is an island that has also suffered the environmental and cultural effects of mismanaged tourism. Mass tourism in Bali began in 1969 with the construction of an international airport, which allowed tourists to arrive directly onto the island rather than via Jakarta. The Indonesian government structured a plan to make Bali the tourism model for the rest of the country. The plan was financed by the United Nations Development Program and carried out by the World Bank.⁴⁵

The original proposal was well planned. It called for the development of luxury tourism around the perimeter of the island, and allowing only day-trips to the interior in order to preserve the cultural integrity of the Balinese. Nevertheless, the island instead drew many budget travelers and backpackers, who did not bring much currency to the island. Upscale tourists arrived, too, and stayed in luxury resorts, primarily owned by big foreign multinational corporations.⁴⁶ Tourism escalated, especially after the Indonesian airline allowed foreign flights directly into Bali. The number of tourists arriving annually quickly surpassed the number of locals.

This rapid unplanned tourism had an extremely negative impact on Bali's environment. The island was unable to deal with the increased pollution and waste. "Informal" landfills were constructed; trash was dumped into canals or left on the streets.⁴⁷ Hotels were built without regard for water, resources or waste, and many of the commercial developments ignored the integrity of historical and cultural sites. The fragile coral reef disappeared, and with it, the advent of beach erosion. Rice paddies were drained to make room for more guesthouses and hotels.⁴⁸

Balinese culture was detrimentally affected by tourism. The Balinese consider themselves a distinct culture, separate from the rest of Indonesia. Ninety-three percent of the Balinese are Hindus, which is unique in Bali, as it is a religion "intertwined with art and nature," and less reliant on law and scripture.⁴⁹ Their religion attempts to find an equilibrium between good and evil. One writer found Balinese religion in "the tiny offerings of rice and flower petals placed daily in doorways, at crossroads, and on countless outdoor altars. It's in the architecture and the orchestras, in the metal tinkling of gamelan music drifting across vibrant green rice paddies. It's in the art and the stone gargoyles, in the Hindu epics brought to life

⁴⁵ MANDALA PROJECTS, TED CASE STUDIES, TOURISM IN BALI Case No. 335 § 1(2)(1)-(2) available at <http://www.american.edu/projects/mandala/TED/BALITOUR.HTM> (October 17, 2000), [hereinafter "TED"].

⁴⁶ MICHAEL HITCHCOCK, VICTOR KING, & MICHAEL PARNWELL, TOURISM IN SOUTH-EAST ASIA 81 (Michael Hitchcock, Victor King, Michael Parnwell eds. 1993) [hereinafter "HITCHCOCK, ET AL."].

⁴⁷ Bruce Mitchell, *Sustainable Development at the Village Level in Bali, Indonesia*, 22 HUMAN ECOLOGY 191 (1994).

⁴⁸ TED, *supra* note 45 § 1(2)(9)-(13).

⁴⁹ *Id.* at 9.

through the play of shadow puppets, and in the supple brown bodies of Balinese dancers."⁵⁰

It is not surprising that Bali's culture has always been considered the island's greatest asset. Although the government felt the need to promote Balinese culture as a method for attracting tourists, nothing was done to counter or even question what effects tourism would have on the Balinese culture. Consequently, culture became commodified. Sacred temples are overcrowded, ritual dances are performed weekly at hotels and handicraft workers are exhorted to make copies of sacred masks, costumes, and jewelry.⁵¹ This is upsetting to many Balinese, but at the same time it is providing income to those who would have had none.

Despite the fact that the highest Hindu body decreed in 1989 that any non-spiritual development must be located at least two kilometers from a sacred temple, a particularly flagrant example of failure to respect Balinese culture in favor of tourism involved a hotel that was built near one of Bali's most sacred temples. This regulation was rarely enforced, however, and regardless of Balinese protest, the Indonesian government permitted the project to go ahead. The resort is owned and managed by outsiders, and the enormous crowds who visit daily often include visitors whose modes of dress cause consternation among the more modest Balinese.⁵²

Beggars and prostitutes multiplied. Shops catering to tourists are common. Interestingly, there is an ongoing World Bank project that has as its aim "to improve urban infrastructure services in Bali to meet the basic needs of an urban city, as well as address the needs of a city that has grown rapidly due to tourism."⁵³ Ironically, the World Bank is now allocating \$110 million of its funds towards rectifying the problems that it initially helped to create; \$10.4 million is ostensibly earmarked to aid the Balinese in "cultural heritage."

C. Tana Toraja, Indonesia

Another less invasive example of tourism's impact on Indonesian culture occurred in the Tana Toraja district. Toraja is a landlocked, rural mountainous region, and an increasingly popular tourist destination. Last year, over 270,000 tourists visited the area, the vast majority of whom passed through the Ujung Pandang district, whose airport recently expanded to accommodate international flights.⁵⁴

In order to improve the economy, the local government has designed a tourist program that involves improvements to Toraja's image. Tourist revenue increased dramatically, and although several of the new hotels are foreign owned, the majority of the restaurants are owned by locals. Moreover, with the exception of luxury items like wine, most of the food for these restaurants as well as for the larger hotels is purchased within Toraja.

⁵⁰ *Id.*

⁵¹ TED, *supra* note 45 at 9.

⁵² TED, *supra* note 45 at 10.

⁵³ NWHO Report, *supra* note 1, at App. 3.

⁵⁴ See Catherine Logie, *The Impacts of Cultural Tourism in Tana Toraja, Indonesia*, GREEN TRAVEL, January 21, 1999.

There have been negative impacts, although they are not yet to the level seen in Bali. Food prices doubled in some instances, and the price of land rose dramatically in certain parts of Toraja. Wealthy Torajans are purchasing land for investment rather than for cultivation, and those from the lower classes are unable to buy. The Torajan people, particularly the youth, are adopting Western ideas and styles of dress. This is causing a problem for the Torajans, who, like the people of Bali, are generally conservative and are embarrassed by tourists' revealing clothing. There is concern that some of the Torajan traditions, ritual ceremonies and dances are being eliminated.

On a more positive note, this concern led one of the village leaders to teach traditional woodcarving to a group of boys who were getting involved with petty crime. This had the dual result of maintaining a cultural tradition and giving the youths an appreciation of their culture. Toraja is currently where so many other despoiled areas once were. The Torajan government must take steps to insure that local interests continue to be protected, and resist the temptation to "sell out" Torajan culture.

D. Tanzania

Another less developed country that suffered culturally and environmentally from large-scale tourism is Tanzania. Big game hunting is a sport that, throughout Africa's history, was long favored by the European aristocracy, and eventually began to contribute to the decline of African wildlife. By the early 20th Century, conservation efforts led to the declaration of many national game reserves. The Serengeti National Park is one of twelve in Tanzania; it contains some four million animals and birds, giving it the greatest concentration of wildlife in the world as well as making it a big tourist draw for hunters.⁵⁵

The law declaring the Serengeti a national park contained an unusual promise: that the indigenous population, the Maasai, could continue to live there. This promise was shortly broken. British colonial officials recognized that the Serengeti was worth more to foreign hunters without Maasai occupying the land. The officials, stating the ridiculous premise that the land could not support both humans and wildlife, passed the National Park Ordinance in 1959. At the conclusion of this agreement, British officials convinced twelve Maasai elders to put their marks on a document reading: "We understand that as a result of this renunciation we shall not be entitled henceforth in the years to come to cross the boundary of the New Serengeti National Park. We agree to move ourselves, our possessions, our cattle, and all our other animals out of this land by the next short rains."⁵⁶ Shortly afterward, six trucks came and removed the Maasai and their few possessions outside the park. It was later revealed that none of the elders knew how to read or write, and that the document had not been explained to them.

When Tanzania became independent in 1961, its single-party socialist system was touted as being essential for unifying the nation's 120 different tribes. Although this system prevented conflict, the profits from tourism and the national parks first went to the government, with hardly any of the currency or benefits

⁵⁵ HONEY, *supra* note 34, at 224.

⁵⁶ *Id.*

trickling down to the Maasai. One Maasai leader stated bitterly, "This is our land, from which we were illegally evicted to create these parks. The profits should have gone first to us for development projects and then we would funnel them upwards, not the other way around."⁵⁷

During this time, tourism continued to develop. On the positive side, most of the hotels and lodges were designed to conform to Tanzania's culture and environment. Additionally, the cost of a Tanzanian safari was prohibitive; they were primarily designed to target the luxury market. This lessened tourism's impact on the area. Still, there were not enough qualified Tanzanians to run these hotels, so large international companies were solicited to manage the facilities. The travel industry declined dramatically in the 1970's due to Tanzania's increased dependence on Kenya. Most tourists flew into Nairobi, just a few hours from Tanzania. The tourists would come to Tanzania for the purpose of seeing the parks, but, as one tourism office worker stated, "it would be safe to say that 90 percent of tourism benefits stayed in Kenya."⁵⁸ Animosity between the two countries increased until Kenya's government closed off all air and land links between them. The border closure and the war with Idi Amin in Uganda essentially halted all tourism to Tanzania.

In retrospect, however, many people involved with tourism view those events as the harbinger of the birth of Tanzania's tourist industry, because local entrepreneurs were forced to start businesses within the country. The border closure gradually led to the privatization of Tanzania's state-run tourism industry. The 1990's saw the burgeoning of foreign investment in Tanzania's tourism industry. In compliance with World Bank and IMF loans, Tanzania enacted a new investment code that offered foreign capital broad incentives and declared tourism a "high priority" area for foreign investors.⁵⁹ The World Bank approved a \$900 million transportation and infrastructure project that included the Killimanjaro International Airport.

The IFC, the World Bank's private sector arm, funded a number of tourism projects in Tanzania's national parks and other ecologically fragile areas. Nevertheless, they are not ecologically sound projects; rather, they involve foreign-owned hotels and tour companies, which contribute little more than a few jobs to the local economy. Other major investment groups also contributed to the construction of five-star luxury hotels in the Serengeti, despite concerns about their impact on the environment, the wildlife, and the Maasai. One major concern was that there was not enough water. As a consequence, the wildlife and the Maasai would be likely to be forced to go without, rather than the tourists who were paying a great deal to stay in the opulent hotel.

One of the large hotels was built next to the Maasai's main route for transporting cattle. The hotel claims that the cattle path is "extremely disruptive"

⁵⁷ *Id.* at 231.

⁵⁸ *Id.*

⁵⁹ *Id.* at 235.

and poses a "tremendous erosion problem."⁶⁰ The Maasai, who were never consulted about the hotel, rightfully feel that the erosion problem is more likely the result of 150,000 tourists and 20,000 vehicles moving in and out of the area along two steep dirt roads per year. The Maasai fear being evicted from the area.

Since 1959, the Maasai have been subject to increasingly strict regulations, and the area in which they can conduct their daily activities is ever diminishing. They have been forced to shift to an agriculture-based subsistence because most of their cattle perished due to disease. As pastoralists, the Maasai previously avoided disease by moving their cattle from place to place, but this became increasingly difficult due to the geographic restrictions.⁶¹

There are some efforts to protect the Maasai. For example, certain areas were designated for the Maasai to sell beads and perform traditional dances for tourists. Still, most of the Maasai are resentful. As one elder said, with respect to the repression of his people, "they have virtually been reduced to museum pieces whose sole function is to show-case their art and culture for the benefit of the tourism and conservation industry."⁶² A local Maasai organization recorded twenty hours of videotape in five villages in which people voiced the "depth of their mistrust, disappointment, and anger."⁶³

The World Bank and its IFC division claim to have adopted rigorous environmental standards, to be sensitive to local communities, and to contribute to national development. But they continue to support huge infrastructure projects that promote mass tourism and foreign-owned companies that do not benefit Tanzanians. Furthermore, in addition to game hunting and photography, the Tanzanian government is encouraging large-scale beach tourism along its coast, which will likely not involve the local community. Alternatively, there have been some recent efforts to promote tourism that involve local communities, but they are few, small in scale, and under funded. The government has developed no overall tourism strategy, but is looking to ecotourism as the future for Tanzania.⁶⁴

III. Alternatives/Sustainable Tourism

It is unlikely that tourism will be abolished outright, or that "virtual tourism" will ever replace the invaluable experiences that one can glean by visiting other cultures.⁶⁵ Tourism is an irreversible social, human, economic and cultural fact.⁶⁶ Global travel need not be a catastrophic problem, if handled properly,

⁶⁰ Roderick Neumann, *Local Challenges to Global Agendas: Conservation, Economic Liberalization, and the Pastoralists' Rights Movement in Tanzania*, 27 ANTIPODE, Oct. 1995, at 374.

⁶¹ HONEY, *supra* note 34 at 239.

⁶² *Id.*

⁶³ Mercy Wambui, *Tanzanian Wildlife Conservation Project Threatens Local Community*, ECONews AFR, Vol. 5, No. 1, Jan. 12, 1996, at <http://www-trees.slu.se/ngorongoro/ngena51a.html>.

⁶⁴ HONEY, *supra* note 34 at 255.

⁶⁵ "Paradoxically, the electronic connections enjoyed by businesses and home computer owners may be encouraging, not discouraging travel." The enormous numbers of travel related services booked over the Internet attest to this fact. Barbara Crosette, *The World: Surprises in the Global Tourism Boom*, N.Y. TIMES, Apr. 12, 1998, §4, at 5.

⁶⁶ INTERNATIONAL COUNCIL ON MONUMENTS AND SITES, CHARTER OF CULTURAL TOURISM, (Brussels, Nov. 1976), available at http://www.icomos.org/tourism/tourism_charter.html.

through planning, sensitivity, and implementation. By taking care to preserve less developed countries' individuality and by giving credence to their cultural heritage, both indigenous people as well as tourists can benefit.

The problem in striking the balance between maintaining an area steeped in tradition and culture and development of tourism programs that will benefit the tourist as well as the local population is summed up in a quote by Charles Lindburgh shortly before his death, describing his experiences in visiting the Tasaday tribe in a remote section of the Philippines:

Sitting on a dry, stony hump in the living cave, cook fires behind me and the morning sun streaming in through mists and hanging vines, I thought of what qualities were missing in the ways of civilized men. Qualities of the senses manifest themselves in tribal areas -- the feel of earth and bark and leaves, the taste of rushing water, the smell of embered chips, the sound of wind. Naked children play along cliff ledges. Youths climb up from the stream with fish, crabs, and frogs.

My tyrannical intellect grew aware of the sensate values it had been suppressing -- of how greatly these values could enhance my twentieth-century life. Somehow I must strike a balance between the civilized and the primitive. It was a balance that both the Tasaday and I were seeking from opposite directions. In achieving it, I did not want to renounce my civilization, and they did not want to renounce their cave-centered culture.⁶⁷

At the World Tourism Fair held in Brussels this past March the African Forum discussed plans for the preservation of African culture and traditions by developing a cultural tourism program around the "Slave Route" which would be designed to boost awareness of the history of this misunderstood period. Africa Economist Digest's editor warned, however, against the restriction of promoting cultural tourism to the slave routes, stating that "cultural tourism must be promoted in its entirety -- African arts, cuisine, among other things," which would provide a better understanding of Africa's people to the outside world.⁶⁸ A Germany-based tour operator involved in the promotion of culturally sensitive tourism pointed out that the "dangers of a cultural sell-out must be considered. The packaging of century-old traditions must progress in a very cautious manner, reconciling economic motives with the needs and expectations of local communities."⁶⁹

The most debated concept for addressing the problems that tourism generates and its negative impact on culture and environment is "sustainable tourism." Sustainable development was defined in 1987 by the Brundtland Commission as "development which meets the needs of the present without

⁶⁷ Gerald L. Allison, *The Impact Of Tourism on Developing Countries - Heritage Preservation and Tourism*, reprinted in MCINTOSH & GOELDNER, *TOURISM PRINCIPLES, PRACTICES, PHILOSOPHIES* 363 (4th ed. 1984).

⁶⁸ JAURA, *supra* note 13.

⁶⁹ *Id.*

compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs."⁷⁰ The United Nations Environment Program added the clause "and does not imply in any way encroachment on national sovereignty."⁷¹ Ideally, sustainable tourism would help provide jobs, increase foreign currency, involve the local population in planning and implementation, and maintain local cultural heritage, both with respect to the environment (cultural monuments, buildings, and sites) as well as to traditions, mores, religions, and other cultural indicators of heritage.

Eco-tourism is one rapidly growing method of sustainable development that can aid in combating the negative cultural and environmental effects of more traditional tourism, especially in vulnerable countries. A corporate eco-tourism consulting firm defines successful eco-tourism as "tourism that must benefit local populations economically and culturally to give them incentives to protect the natural resources which create the attraction."⁷² The government of Aruba defines eco-tourism as "tourism which does not have the negative impact of large scale development which includes cultural devastation and the destruction of natural ecosystems."⁷³

Eco-tourism is an incentive to developing countries to maintain their environment and culture, especially because these countries are often those under extreme pressure to destroy their environment to pay off debts, or to develop more industry in order to better compete in the global marketplace.⁷⁴ For example, in Costa Rica, rainforests preserved for eco-tourism have become many times more profitable per hectare than land cleared for pastures and fields.⁷⁵

Eco-tourism is not without its critics, however. Alan Clovis, Vice President of Trinidad and Tobago's Hotel and Tourist Association, pointed out that unfortunately, it is often difficult to sell a "Western abstraction about saving the environment" to people who have not known what it is like to experience a shortage of natural beauty. He states that what outsiders see as a limited, precious resource, local people see their forest or beach "as an asset and they want a return the same as anybody else."⁷⁶ Furthermore, frequently there are not enough jobs in eco-tourism to help all of a developing country's people. The mayor of one Brazilian town, who every morning faces 200 unemployed loggers, commented, "My father and grandfather made a living off logs and my grandchildren might make a living off the

⁷⁰ World Commission on Environment and Development (the Brundtland Commission), 1986 Report, available at <http://www.iisd.org/educate/learn/a1.htm>.

⁷¹ Statement by the UNEP Governing Council on Sustainable Development, Annex II, U.N. Doc. UNEP/GC/L.37 (1989).

⁷² J.W. Krutch, *Eco-Tourism International*, 1997, at <http://catalog.com/kcv/eti/eti.html>.

⁷³ Milton Ponson, *Eco-Tourism in Aruba*, 1995, available at <http://www.aruba.pavillion.com/news/Eco-4/Ecotol.html>.

⁷⁴ Andrea Yoder, *Sustainable Development, Ecotourism, and Globalization: Are They Compatible?* (Spring 1998), at <http://darwin.bio.uci.edu/~sustain/global/sensem/S98/Yoder/yoder.html>.

⁷⁵ CHEN, *supra* note 24 at 210.

⁷⁶ STAMMER, *supra* note 68. This was the same trend I noticed while living in St. Thomas, as the sides of the roads were in many instances littered with trash.

Internet. But what are the rest of us going to do? If I can't provide them with jobs, housing, and food, they will eat the rainforest -- whether that's sustainable or not."⁷⁷

Most people involved in the task of maintaining culture while promoting eco-tourism stress the importance of getting the local population involved with the programs. For example, when Tavenui villagers discussed the development of a forest park, the women were concerned that tourism would erode their cultural values, especially in light of the fact that most of the villagers are Catholic and extremely modest. Their solution was to build the forest visitors center a respectable distance from the village, which allowed them to maintain their daily routines without the intrusion of unwelcome Western values.⁷⁸

Engaging local people directly in the business of eco-tourism helps keep capital in the developing country rather than the bulk of profits going to foreign investors, as usually occurs with traditional tourism. Foreign entrepreneurs, on the other hand, export the bulk of the profits to their home countries. The World Bank reports that over half of the gross tourism revenues to developing countries end up in the hands of business owners or investors in developed countries.⁷⁹

With true eco-tourism, profits trickle up, rather than down, which is the general policy behind international lending institutions like the World Bank. To promote this phenomenon, some foreign travel outfitters support a program called "Trickle Up," which awards small grants directly to locals. Some 250,000 natives in 90 countries have received these grants, which average a return of four U.S. dollars for every dollar invested.⁸⁰

With the introduction of tourism to a developing country, one way to insure that the design and building of tourist structures as an asset to the country's culture is to get the locals involved with planning and implementation. For example, in the development and construction of the Tanjong Jara Beach Hotel on the east coast of Malaysia, the architect familiarized himself with traditional Malaysian building forms.⁸¹ Part of this preparation involved becoming familiar with local artists and craftspeople, and utilizing their skills. The government had established a formal program for the advancement and preservation of the woodcarving trade in east Malaysia, until the construction of the hotel, there was no major outlet for their work. The work of local weavers and kite makers has also been incorporated into the hotel's design. The similar resurrection and use of indigenous craftwork has been integrated into structures in Fiji, Samoa, New Guinea, Hawaii and Thailand. This practice is not limited to architecture, but also extends to dance, batik and

⁷⁷ Diana James, *Cultural Tourism: Assessing the Impacts of Cultural Tourism on Indigenous Communities Involved in Cultural Tourism*, World Ecotourism Conference (Oct. 17-23, 1999), at <http://www.borneoecotours.com/wec/diana.html>.

⁷⁸ *Id.*

⁷⁹ Bill Belleville, *Eco-Tourism Offers Cure For Evils Visited On Land*, ORLANDO SENTINEL, Feb. 26, 1995, at G1.

⁸⁰ *Id.* This article points out the difficulties we are having closer to home. In the Florida Keys, there is an ongoing fight between conservationists, who want to halt the destruction of the coral reefs by limiting the number of divers, and the owners of dive shops, who are interested in short-term profits.

⁸¹ ALLISON, *supra* note 74, at 363.

pageantry, all of which have seen revival. The key is maintaining sensitivity so that the use is not degrading or false in any way.

Some critics, however, believe the answer is to involve both the government of the developing country as well as the people in tourism-related projects in order for the projects to be eligible for World Bank loans.⁸² The belief is that this would allow the incorporation of more development benefits for the communities.

There are many other proposed options to the potential destruction of culture by the tourism industry. For example, in Europe, a program called "agritourism" has been instigated which shows farmers how to take in paying guests. Although rural traditions of taking in summer guests date back to the last century, prices for farm products and consequently, rural incomes, have been dwindling, and agritourism is helping European farmers to preserve architectural and cultural heritage, as well as maintain their farms and continue to produce distinctive products like wines and cheeses.⁸³ Agritourism has the further effect of inducing young people to remain in the countryside, rather than relocating to the cities because of the inability to support themselves through agriculture. This would prevent the "family farm" from becoming an all-too-rapidly vanishing remnant of the industrialized world's rural past.⁸⁴

Thus, agritourism, if carefully planned, could be a viable method by which developing countries could support themselves, and by which tourists could learn about the culture of the people without an overwhelming negative impact. Furthermore, these programs allow tourist dollars to remain in the country in which they are spent, rather than going to hotel chains and other multinational corporations. In Europe, between 1991 and 1998, 2.3 billion dollars were spent on programs to promote agritourism.⁸⁵ The World Bank, instead of funding huge hotel programs in less developed countries, could start channeling funds to agritourism. Critics of the World Bank would argue, however, that these programs are unlikely to be implemented, because they will not contribute as much to the international market as would larger projects.

IV. Conclusion

Ideally, taking on the role of "tourist" changes one's behavior for the better. "His possibilities know no bounds, for he is on a pilgrimage or he is wayfaring, the best thing for his soul. He is at the same time retreating from routine and diversion. In this plastic formative mood he is essentially a new and different person. Traveling is broadening because of the nature not of travel, but of the traveler. He is apt to be a boob, but he may be the hope of mankind."⁸⁶

⁸² YODER, *supra* note 82.

⁸³ Truls M. Fagrell, *Mexican Heritage, Europe's Farm "Bed and Barns" Example for Mexico*, THE NEWS, NOVEDADES EDITORES, Oct. 24, 1998. The author uses Europe's program as an opportunity for Mexico to generate tourism income without compromising the environment or cultural heritage.

⁸⁴ CHEN, *supra* note 24, p. 164.

⁸⁵ *Id.*

⁸⁶ PAUL SHEPARD, *MAN IN THE LANDSCAPE: A HISTORICAL VIEW OF THE ESTHETICS OF NATURE* 156 (1991).

Tourism has had deleterious effects in all parts of the world. Yet a nascent awareness of these problems is emerging, and alternatives are being proposed. Whether the World Bank and the IMF are the best resources for the promotion of tourism remains to be seen. The World Bank is, remember, a bank, not a philanthropic institution. Thus, from the most cynical viewpoint, the World Bank would benefit most from implementing ruinous projects with disastrous effects, and then later instituting a restorative project, all the while expecting to be repaid from both projects. The World Bank claims to be serious about helping developing countries while at the same time giving deference to their environments and cultures. If this were indeed true, the people in developing countries would be better off if these same institutions would teach them how to fish rather than merely giving them a fish for a day.